Judges and Legal Institutions

Jack Knight

Duke University

Preliminaries

- Courts as an institution
 - Primary questions: How do judges make decisions?
 What are the factors that affect these decisions?
- Relevance of judges for NIE research
- Differences across legal systems
 - Abstract vs. Concrete Constitutional Review
 - Unitary vs. Specialized Courts
 - Common vs. Civil Law
- Structure of Discussion

Elements of the Analysis

- The individual judge
- Other relevant actors
- Institutional Context
- Outcomes

The Individual Judge

- Reasoning and Motivations
 - The Traditional Law-Social Science Debate
 - Three Approaches to Judicial Reasoning
 - Legal
 - Attitudinal
 - Strategic
 - The Empirical Evidence
 - Moving Beyond The Traditional Debate
- Implications for Positive and Normative Analysis

Other Strategic Actors

- Other judges
- Attorneys
- Amicus Curiae
- Political Actors
- Community at large

Collegial Courts

- Cert decisions; anticipating votes on the merits
- Bargaining over opinion writing
- Testing models of coalition formation
- Dissent behavior
- Panel effects

Other Strategic Actors

- Attorneys
 - Oral argument
- Amicus Curiae
- Political Actors
 - Inter-branch relations
 - Federal Systems
- Community at large
 - Public Opinion

Institutional Context

- Judicial practice
- Hierarchy
- Separation of Powers

Outcomes

- Disposition of Cases
- Creating the content of the law
- Contributing to social outcomes

Promising Avenues of Future Research

- Comparative Focus
- The Nature and Content of the Law
- Interrelationship with other legal and political institutions
- Normative Project: Institutionalizing the Impartiality of Courts
- Normative Project: Institutionalizing the rule of Law